

PRE-BUDGET MEMORANDUM 2020-21 ON INDIRECT TAXES

I. <u>CUSTOMS DUTY</u>:

Sr. No	Section/ Subject	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation		
1.	Applicability of Safeguard Duty in respect of Solar Cells (manufactured from Silicon Wafers)				
		when it is cleared from SEZ to DTA Unit			
	to protect th	pose of levying Safeguard Duty is e Domestic Manufacturers which also. The Department of Revenue.	An amendment is sought in Sec 30(a) of The SEZ Act 2005 as follows -		
	include SEZ Also. The Department of Revenue, Ministry of Finance has imposed safeguard duty on 'Solar cells whether or not assembled in modules' for the period and rates specified therein vide Gazzete notification No. 01/2018-Customs(SG) dated 30.07.2018 in respect of imports from China and Malaysia.		Any goods removed from a Special Economic Zone to the Domestic Tariff Area shall be chargeable to duties of customs including anti-dumping, countervailing and safeguard duties under the Customs Tariff Act, 1975, where applicable, as leviable on such goods when imported;		
	However, manufacture of Solar Cell by SEZ Units by procuring Silicon Wafer from China, Malaysia and also using domestic materials and clearing to DTA is being subject to safeguard duty due to anomalous interpretation of Sec 30(a) of The SEZ Act 2005. It is implied from Document No D 12/26/2017-SEZ dated 30th November 2018 issued by The Ministry of Commerce that until Section 30 of the SEZ Act is amended, safeguard duty is applicable on clearance from SEZ to DTA, if it is leviable on any imports. This is not the intention of the statue or The Government.		[Provided that no safeguard duties under the Customs Tariff Act, 1975 shall be applicable incase any article is manufactured in SEZ from indigenous raw material or from import of items on which no safeguard duty is applicable]1 []1 - Amendment required Any other amendment which maybe fit in the circumstances		
	To give boost Manufacture of Solar Cells in SEZ and aid the Govt. of India's aim to promote "Make In India" and "Solar Power" an amendment is sought in Sec 30(a) of The SEZ Act 2005.				
2	Allowing export incentive on Service Exports (SEIS) on a monthly basis (like MEIS) instead of				
-		resently in force	Event incentive on Comice Events (CEIC)		
	on a yearly b	ive on services (SEIS), is available pasis today unlike MEIS instead of presently in force. This leads to	Export incentive on Service Exports (SEIS) should also be allowed on a monthly basis (like MEIS) instead of yearly basis presently in		

Regd Office The Bengal Chamber of Commerce and Industry Royal Exchange 6 Netaji Subhas Road Kolkata 700 001 P +91 33 2230 8396 | 3711 | 3733 | 3746 F +91 33 2230 1289 E bencham@bengalchamber.com www.bengalchamber.com



Sr. No	Section/ Subject Issue		Suggestion / Recommendation
	liquidity crun	ch and financial hardship.	force
	export incentive on Service Exports (SEIS) should also be allowed on a monthly basis (like MEIS) instead of yearly basis presently in force		
3	Ambiguity in	Chapter 98.01 governing project im	ports – Irrigation Projects :
	Chapter	This Chapter allows import of	Since the notification allows exemption of
	98.01 of	goods under project import	goods for water supply projects (which is
	Customs	regulation for various projects	nothing but Irrigation Project) for Agriculture
	Tariff Act,	including Irrigation projects.	and Industrial use, the entry in 9801 covering
	1975		Irrigation Projects has become redundant and
		However, by a separate	a matter of controversy and dispute.
		Notification No.14/2004-Cus.	
		dated 08.01.2004 Government	In view of specific exemption by notification
		has exempted Water supply	for Water supply projects for Agriculture, the
		project under Heading 98.01 for	entry of Irrigation Project under 9801 is
		Agriculture or Industrial use from	required to be deleted to avoid ambiguity and
		whole of the basic duty and	provide clarity in the regulation.
		additional duty.	



II. GOODS & SERVICE TAX :

Sr. No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation		
1.	Exports And Inverted Duty Refunds under GST – Denial of refund of Inverted Duty Claim of Refund on the ground that such turnover is "Export" Turnover and Not "Inverted Duty" Turnover			
	Incase of Exports with payment of Duty, which also falls under "Inverted Duty Structure", The GST Departments are denying refund of Inverted Duty Claim of Refund on the ground that such turnover is "Export" Turnover and Not "Inverted Duty" Turnover. For Eg. Incase Input Tax Rate is 18% and Output Tax Rate is 12% and the Exporter is exporting on payment of duty, the difference of 6% in tax is denied as inverted duty refunds and remains stuck up forever. On the contrary, the same is allowed incase of Export without payment of duty. The legislature cannot have two rules for the same exports and especially a rule which defies logic.			
2.	Exports Refunds Denial by WB SGST Officers by VEOR Basis even after Section 15 of The CGST Act is Certain Officers of West Bengal SGST Department are delaying the refunds on Flimsy grounds as to why the Valuation of Exports shall be on CIF Basis and not on FOB Basis even after Section 15 of The CGST Act is aptly clear on The Valuation Rules under GST. It is held that the State of West Bengal has an internal SOP for officers to act as such. It is pertinent to note that the CGST Officers are acting in the reverse way in this regard. It is suggested to come out with a circular clarifying the above. Also, all SOPs of GST Departments across the country should be consistent to each other.	It is suggested to come out with a circular clarifying the above. Also, all SOPs of GST Departments across the country should be consistent to each other.		
3.	Claiming of Refund of IGST where the taxpayer has inadvertently availed Higher Rate of Drawback during the transition phase of GST Implementation of July 2017 to September 2017			
	During the transition phase of GST Implementation of July 2017 to September	It is requested to come out with a circular so that all such cases can be solved and pending		



C=	THE BENGAL CHAN			
Sr. No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation		
	2017, many tax payers had inadvertently claimed higher rate of drawback by selecting "A" instead of "B" in the Shipping Bill. This was a phase when even Departmental Officers were not clear about the correct procedural requirements. This error has lead to loss of huge amount of Refunds of IGST. The Madras High Court in the case of Ms VSG Exports Pvt. Ltd. in its Order dated 2nd April 2019, has ruled that the Government must give an opportunity to rectify such errors and refund the resultant IGST. However the procedure for the same is still not implemented on ground.	refunds can be released.		
4.	Scrapping of Rule 36(4) of CGST Rules 2017 made			
	Rule 36(4) states that "Input tax credit to be availed by a registered person in respect of invoices or debit notes, the details of which have not been uploaded by the suppliers under sub-section (1) of section 37, shall not exceed 20 per cent of the eligible credit available in respect of invoices or debit notes the details of which have been uploaded by the suppliers under sub-section (1) of section 37." This Rule has the effect of putting tremendous burden on the Liquidity of Businesses which are already under stress and needs to be scrapped ab-initio	This Rule has the effect of putting tremendous burden on the Liquidity of Businesses which are already under stress and needs to be scrapped ab-initio		
5.	Non-availability of ITC in respect of immovable p	property for setting up factory building, hotels		
	etc			
	Section 17(5) of The CGST Act 2017 Blocks the ITC in respect of Works contract and Construction.	The amount spent for Works contract and Construction Factory Buildings, Hotels and all other construction is for furtherance of		
	This is a huge burden for all new constructions including Factory Buildings, Hotels, etc. The	business and should in no way be blocked from availing ITC of.		
	amount spent for Works contract and Construction Factory Buildings, Hotels and all other construction is for furtherance of business and should in no way be blocked from availing	The CGST Act must be amended for allowance of these ITC		



Sr.	THE BENGAL CHA		
Sr. No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation	
	ITC of.		
	This results in "cascading effect of GST" which is against the very foundation of the GST Law.		
6	Non availability of ITC in vacance of modi plains	veneraliture done for the organicular	
6.	Non-availability of ITC in respect of medi-claim e Section 17(5) of The CGST Act 2017 Blocks the	1 -	
	ITC in respect of medi-claim expenditure for employees.	allowance of ITC on medical expenditure done for employees.	
	In this era where medical expenses are unimaginable and where there is not much social benefits from the Government for medical contingencies, it is but unjust to disallow ITC on the same.		
	This also results in "cascading effect of GST" which is against the very foundation of the GST Law.		
7.	Allowing IGST credit available to be adjusted ag consignment	gainst IGST payment towards import	
	At present IGST on Imports are paid in Cash at the time of clearing The Bill of Entry even though the Importer may have an IGST credit in his ITC Register on the GST Portal. This is causing a huge financial hardship on importers.	allowance of ITC on medical expenditure	
	A procedure must be developed for allowing the IGST credit available to be adjusted against IGST payment towards import consignment.		
8	Taxability of EPC contract of setting up Solar Pov	ver Generating Systems under Goods and	
	According to the target set by the GOI, the country is planning to generate 100 GW (1,00,000 MW) of solar power by 2020. The target also aims to reduce the cost of solar power generation. Since the supply and distribution of electricity is exempt from GST, hence ITC on the Inputs, Input Services and Capital goods are not available to the Power	Hence the levy of GST on these Solar Power Generation System was should be reduced to 6.3% (considering 90% of the contract taxable @5% and 10% of the contract taxable @18%)	



Sr.					THE BENGAL CHAMB
	lasus				Suggestion / Recommendation
No	Issue	.1 -		c	
	Companies which are the Consumers of the				
	Solar Power Generation Systems.				
	The levy of GST @189	% on the	ese Solar P	ower	
	Generation System v				
	(considering 70% of th				
	=			w5/6	
	and 30% of the contract	т тахаріе	@18%)		
	However in the instant	case the	supply of		
	constitutes as follows –				
	Description	% (a	pprox.)		
	(i) Total supply of				
	goods				
	Solar Module				
	(This item is				
	completely movable				
	from one place to	70%			
	other without	70%			
	damaging in				
	structure even after				
	installation.				
	(b) Other parts/sub-				
	parts such as				
	inverters, cables,				
	structures,		90%		
	switchgear items		3070		
	etc. for fixing and				
	connecting the solar				
	modules to harness				
	its power				
	•	20%			
	such as controllers				
	and switches				
	(All these items are				
	movable from one				
	place to another				
	without damaging				
	the structure even				
	after installation and				
	commissioning)				
	(ii) Civil work and othe	r	10%		
	services		10/0		



C :				THE BENGAL CHAME
Sr. No	Issue			Suggestion / Recommendation
	Hence the levy of GST on the Generation System was should 6.3% (considering 90% of the @5% and 10% of the contract to	d be reduc contract ta	ed to xable	
9	Refunds pending with "PAY & Aup with them	ACCOUNTS"	' Sectio	on of the CGST Department – No way to follow
	A Considerable amount of refunds across the country are blocked at the PAY & ACCOUNTS Section. There is no way to contact them also as entry is restricted in that area. This has given rise to the problem of delay in refunds on the one hand and it also promulgates inethical conduct among these officers on the other as there is no audit trail also of the follow up done with them.			The PAY & ACCOUNTS Section should be given e-mail Ids so that follow up can be done with them. Also they must be made responsible for the delay in refunds done by them.
10.	Domestic manufacturers of science	entific Equip	oments	s are in difficult situations
	There are many manufacturing scientific and laboratory equipments which are being supplied to the large number of Research Institutes, Universities, hospitals etc. In view of the custom Notification No 51 dated 23.7. 1996 as amended vide amended notification 43/2017 dated 30.6.2017 all such import of equipments are exempted from the payment of custom duty including Integrated GST. Further note that even consumables will also cover under the above notification. As compared to the above, local industries manufacturing same product including		The above exemption notification has made the Indian Industry completely unviable unless the similar exemption benefit is extended to the Indian Industry. While we do support the above exemption to the institutes, we request you to provide the similar support to the Indian manufacturing Industry.	
	consumables will be subjected to payment of full GST as under: 84211910 GST Rate 18% 84798200 GST Rate 18%			



	THE BENGAL CHAN			
Sr. No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation		
NO	Plastic consumables (Disposables Single Time Used) are classified under BTN 3926 GST Rate 28%, 3923 GST Rate 18%			
11	Supply of Labour by the Labour Contractor			
	Under the above arrangement, Labour contractor supplies the labour and raises two invoices per month i.e. for (a) actual cost of labour as reimbursement and (b) his commission. In the absence of the clarification, the cost of labour will be subject to charge of GST and would not come under the head of Pure Agent. As a result, both the above costs will come under GST	To qualify as Pure agency, the Contractor has to be provide some other services. This will be a great hardship particularly to those who are using the above services, the output of which is non-taxable.		
12	CSR Expenses – application of RCM			
	The Companies are required to spend annually about 2% of its average profits on account of CSR. Normally such expenses are made through authorised NGOs and sometimes directly by the Company.	A clarification is needed about the applicability of GST and RCM on such expenses for the benefits of the taxpayers.		
13	Supplies made by SEZ unit to DTA Unit			
	Under the previous VAT laws, Supplies to DTA by SEZ unit were subject to payment of VAT/CST. Also the importer were subjected to payment of Custom duty as applicable under the Custom Act. Under the existing GST laws, SEZ units are	We are sure that the above double taxation is not the intention of the Revenue. We find some issues on the above subject in certain SEZs and hence request you to clarify the issue so that double taxation does not arise.		
	outside the purview of the GST legislations although the importers of goods (DTA) from SEZ unit are subject to payment of IGST as it is considered as import under Customs.			
	However, under IGST law, supplies made by SEZ unit to DTA unit are not considered as "export" in terms of section 2(5) of the IGST Act. As per the said provision export means taking of goods out of India in a place outside India. Hence, if we go with the above provision, supplies made by SEZ unit to DTA Unit will not be considered			



Sr.		THE BENGAL CHAMI
No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation
	within the purview of "Export" and it will be	
	considered as "supply" and accordingly it will be	
	subject to payment of IGST. At the same time	
	the importer i.e. DTA unit will also be liable to	
	pay IGST as applicable under the Custom Act.	
14	Reverse Charge Tax for Exempted unit	
	Tax is payable for RCM under two	This being a hardship and the fully exempted
	circumstances u/s 9(3) and 9(4) of the CGST Act	unit may be kept outside the purview of RCM;
	as under:	
	9(3) – Applicable in respect of receipt of certain	
	goods and services – This is payable by the	
	recipient irrespective of status as registered or	
	un-registered or exempted.	
	9(4) – Applicable for receipt of goods or services	
	purchased/sourced from unregistered dealer by	
	a registered dealer.	
	In view of the above provisions, even the	
	exempted unit (e.g. dealers of agricultural	
	commodities under exemption category) will be	
	liable to take registration and pay tax on receipt	
	of certain services or goods under RCM	
	although their output tax is ZERO. Further since	
	they need to take registration in view of	
	applicability of section 9(3), they would be	
	required to pay RCM even in respect of	
	purchases of goods and services from	
	unregistered dealer under section 9(4) as and	
	when it is made applicable.	
15	Inter-state movement of construction equipmen	t and spares from one branch to another: -
	Valuation under GST (Rule 32 (7) of GST Valuation	I
	In EPC contracts, movement of construction	To avoid hurdles and disputes over valuation
	equipment from one project to another is	of movement of equipments between distinct
	imperative to maintain continuous and	persons, it is requested to clarify that as
	uninterrupted flow of work process.	provided under Rule 32 (7) value of inter-
	These equipments are practically old and used	state movement of construction equipments
	and its movement are on principal to principal	and spares from one site to another is treated
	basis and there is no consideration or value	as NIL.
	addition.	



Sr.		THE BENGAL CHAMB
Sr. No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation
	They were not qualifying as "Stock Transfer"	
	even under Pre-GST regime.	
	Spares are mostly charged off to expenses	
	account at the point of purchase itself. Therefore at the time of transfer there will not	
	be any value.	
	ac any value.	
	Even if such movements constitute as supply	
	and liable to levy of GST wherein the recipient is	
	entitled to a full ITC which means it is Revenue	
	Neutral transaction for the exchequer but the	
	same leads to the following issues in every	
	movement:	
	 Valuation to be done for such movement 	
	Additional compliance requirement	
	Unwarranted delay	
	·	
16	Non-availability of ITC of GST paid on advances	
	Section 16(2) of the CGST Act mandates four	It is requested for appropriate amendment to
	conditions for availing Input tax credit. One of	the section so that issue of receipt voucher is
	them being actual receipt of services.	treated as a document for availing ITC
	This results in a scenario wherein tax paid on	This would facilitate taxpayers reducing their
	advances is not eligible for ITC till the time of	working capital requirement
	receipt of invoice or services leading to working	
	capital blockage.	As an example, in a ship building industry, it
		would take nearly 2-3 years to materialize the
		advance amount leading huge working capital
		blockage.
17	Exclusion of Interest, Late Fee and Penalty from	Transaction Value - Section 15 (1) (d) of GST
	Act, 2017	, , , ,
	As per the above proviso, interest, or late free	Transaction value is the price actually paid or
	or penalty for delayed payment of any	payable for supply of goods and or services.
	consideration for any supply etc. is to be	Laterant late for a second lateral
	included in the Transaction Value.	Interest, late free or penalty may arise due to
		contractual provisions or due to an issue between seller and buyer.
		between seller and buyer.
		Hence it is incorrect to add interest, or late
		fee or penalty for delayed payment of any



Sr. No Issue Suggestion / Recommendation consideration for any supply etc. in	
consideration for any supply etc. in	
Transaction Value.	the
It is requested to delete the entry i 15 (1) of GST Act, 2017.	n Section
18 Clarity on ITC credit of GST paid on Cranes, Dumpers. Grader, Tipper, Excavator etc - (5) of CGST Act, 2017	- Section 17
Equipments like, Grader, Cranes, Dumpers, Tippers etc. are construction equipments but require registration under the Motor Vehicles Act. because they are motor driven and capable of traveling on the road. However, these equipments are solely used for construction work such as earthwork, leveling, movement of goods from one place to another, excavation, etc As per Section 17 (5) of GST Act, Notwithstanding anything contained in sub section (1) of section 16 and sub section (1) of section 18, input tax credit shall not be available in respect of the following, namely: (a) motor vehicles and other conveyances except they are used: (i) for making the following taxable supplies, namely (A) for supply of such vehicles or conveyances; or (b) (c) (iii) for transportation of goods These equipments are solely used for construction work such as earthwork, leveling, excavation etc. though they are required to be registered under Motor Vehicles Act because they are motor driven for traveling on the road. To remove unnecessary doubt and unwarranted disputes by the Reve availment of ITC on these equipmen suggested that after the entry of (ii Transportation of goods" the follow be incorporated: (iii) Construction equipment falling Chapter of HSN. For your information, in the questic answers published by CBEC relating Mining Sector, for Question 21: (W charged on purchase of all earth m machinery including JCB, tippers, d a mining company be allowed as incredit)? CBE&C answer is as under: (a) motor vehicles and other conveyances; or (b) (c) (b) (c) (c) (d) for supply of such vehicles or conveyances; or (b) (iii) for transportation of goods These equipments are solely used for construction work such as earthwork, leveling, excavation etc. though they are required to be registered under Motor Vehicles Act because they are motor driven for traveling on the road. Applying the same analogy, please ITC is allowed on Construction equipment, viz., dumpers. Thus, as per present pron	enue over ents, it is i) for wing entry gunder any ons and g to fill GST loving lumpers by lumpers by lumpers by lumpers of the motor d therein. of Section pression e meaning ection 2 of n does not tippers, visions, the moving lers used lining eredit. clarify that lipments



		THE BENGAL CHAMB	
Sr.	1	Suggestion / Recommendation	
No	Issue		
10	Charing of amounts / Allegation of and had	Crown Commonical Divisions (City and Service)	
19	Sharing of expenses/Allocation of cost between		
	Allocation of cost/sharing of expenses or	Since the provisions in GST are silent and	
	sharing of cost incurred on common utilities	allocation of cost/sharing of expenses or	
	between Group Companies/ JV/ Divisions/ sites/ etc. are common business practice and	sharing of cost of common utilities between Group Companies/ Divisions/Sites etc. are	
	involved in mere accounting entries.	common business practice and involved in	
	involved in mere accounting entires.	mere accounting entries. And hence it is	
	Journal Vouchers/debit notes representing such	requested to clarify that in the absence of	
	sharing of expenses/allocation of cost on	any consideration or value addition such	
	principal to principal basis without any	journal vouchers/debit notes would not	
	consideration or value addition do not satisfy	attract GST.	
	the definition of supply and hence would be		
	attract GST.		
20	Benefit of zero rate to the sub-contractors of SEZ		
	Under Section 16 of the IGST Act, supply of	It is suggested for inclusion of adequate	
	goods or services or both to a Special Economic	provisions in the IGST so that the benefit of	
	Zone Developer or a Unit would be zero rated	zero rated supply shall also be extended to	
	supply.	sub-contractors providing supply of	
	The musicions are cilented to whather herefit	goods/services to SEZ Units/ Developers.	
	The provisions are silent as to whether benefit of zero rated supply is available to sub-	It is also suggested that:	
	contractors supplying goods/services to SEZ.	To enable sub-contractor to supply	
	contractors supplying goods/services to SEZ.	goods/services without payment of GST, the	
		LUT issued in favour of the principal	
		contractor be allowed to be utilized by sub-	
		contractor for the exemption goods/services.	
		In the fact, Rule 10 of SEZ Rules updated	
		upto 2010 states that: ,	
		Provided further that exemptions, drawbacks	
		and concessions on the goods and services	
		allowed to a Developer or Co-developer, as	
		the case may be, shall also be available to the	
		contractors including subcontractors	
		appointed by such Developer or Co-	
		developer, and all the documents in such	
		cases shall bear the name of the Developer or	
		Co-developer along with the contractor or	
		sub-contractor and these shall be filed jointly	
		in the name of the Developer or Co-developer and the contractor or sub-contractor, as the	
		and the contractor of Sub-contractor, as the	



_	THE BENGAL CHAM			
Sr.	lacus	Suggestion / Recommendation		
No	Issue	casa may ba		
		case may be		
		CCT process in a CE7 Unit is attached as		
		GST process in a SEZ Unit is attached as Annexure-1.		
		Annexure-1.		
21	Provisions relating to refund of GST - Section 54	(6) of GST Act. 2017		
	Section 54 read with rules for refund of tax	The assessee exporting goods and or services		
	made there under allows 90% as provisional	is claiming legitimate refund of tax suffered		
	refunds for exports of goods/ services.	on such exports and hence the refund of the		
	The same of the property of the same of th	same should not be conditional which is very		
	The provisional refund is subject to various	much necessary to encourage exports.		
	conditions including conditions on pending	mach necessary to encourage exports.		
	proceedings etc. which is totally unwarranted.			
22	Levy of GST on transactions happening outside In	ndia: Section 10 (1) (b) of IGST Act 2017		
	Section 10 (1) (b) of IGST Act mentions that	Requested for suitable amendments to		
	supply of goods on the direction of third party	ensure non-applicability of GST on		
	would deemed to be made to said third party	transactions which take place outside Indian		
	even if goods are delivered to any other person	territory.		
	at different location except in case of import	territory.		
	and export outside India. Due to this provision it			
	appears that if Indian Vendor is billing to Indian			
	Customer against the supply made from one			
	location to another location other than in India			
	as per direction of Indian Customer, GST is			
	leviable on transaction though goods have been			
	5 5			
	moved within non taxable territory. Further it			
	appears this error happened unintentionally by			
	the Govt. during drafting of law. This issue is			
	creating confusion in merchant trading activity			
	about applicability of GST.			
23	Distribution of input tax credit on central spends	under Input Service Distributor (ISD) model		
	The GST law provides that input tax credits	Recommendation: Tax payer should be		
	accumulated by an ISD should be distributed in	allowed to distribute ISD credits based on		
	the ratio of amongst other distinct person based	sales or 'turnover'.		
	on 'Turnover'. Further, the term 'Turnover' is	Sales of tarriover i		
	defined to include sale and stock transfer			
	between distinct persons. Since, GST is a			
	consumption based tax, it is recommended that			
	an option be provided to the tax payer to			
	distribute ISD credits based on sales or			
	'turnover'. The tax payer should be allowed to			
	structure his operation in such a way that he			
	Structure his operation in Such a way that he			



Sr.			THE BENGAL CHAMB	
No	Issue		Suggestion / Recommendation	
		up with high GST refund in one		
		put liability in the others.		
		,		
24	Document required for availing input Tax credit(ITC)			
	Rule 36 of the	e CGST Rules provides that Input	In the document mentioned in ITC Rules,	
	Tax Credit car	n be availed by a registered person	Service Tax certificate and Challan for RCM	
	on the basis o	of following documents, namely:	and Unregistered person should be included.	
	a) an inv	oice issued by the supplier of		
	goods	or services or both in accordance		
	with t	he provisions of section 31;		
	b) an inv	oice issued in accordance with the		
	provis	sions of clause (f) of sub-section (3)		
	of sec	tion 31, subject to the payment of		
	tax;			
		it note issued by a supplier in		
		dance with the provisions of		
	sectio			
	d) a bill d	•		
	•	out Service Distributor invoice or		
	•	Service Distributor credit note or		
	•	ocument issued by an Input Service		
		outor in accordance with the		
	provisions of sub rule (1) of Rule 54.			
	in the Rule:	owing documents are not included		
		e tax certificate for transportation		
	•	ods by rail (STTG certificate) issued		
	•	e India Railways, along with the		
	•	copies of the railway receipts		
		oned in the STTG certificate.\		
		llan evidencing payment of Tax by		
	the re	cipient under reverse charge.		
	The Rule prov	vides that in case of reverse charge		
	credit will be	available on the basis of an invoice		
	issued in acco	ordance with the provisions of		
	clause (f) of s	ub-section (3) of section 31.		
	Section 21/21	(f) provides that provides that a		
	• •	rson who is liable to pay tax under		
	•	3) or sub-section (4) of section 9		
	•	invoice in respect of goods or		
		oth received by him from the		
		is not registered on the date of		



Sr.		THE BENGAL CHAMB
No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation
	receipt of goods or services or both;	
	Section 9(3) provides that the Government may, on the recommendations of the Council, by notification, specify categories of supply of goods or services or both, the tax on which shall be paid on reverse charge basis by the recipient of such goods or services or both and all the provisions of this Act shall apply to such recipient as if he is the person liable for paying the tax in relation to the supply of such goods or services or both. Section 9(4) provides that the central tax in respect of the supply of taxable goods or services or both by a supplier, who is not registered, to a registered person shall be paid	
	by such person on reverse charge basis as the recipient and all the provisions of this Act shall apply to such recipient as if he is the person liable for paying the tax in relation to the supply of such goods or services or both.	
	In view of the above, in GST regime each registered person has to raise invoice for each transaction under reverse charge and for each transaction with unregistered person and avail cenvat credit on the basis of that invoice.	
	Currently, in case of reverse charge cenvat credit is availed on the basis of single challan. Availment of tax credit on the basis of each invoice raised under reverse charge and from unregistered vendor will create difficulty for the assessee. e.g. in case of GTA a large manufacturing company deals with thousand of transporter who raises lacs of transaction. As per section 31(3)(f), registered person has to raise invoice for each transaction and avail credit on the basis of that invoice. Currently, cenvat credit is availed on the basis of a single challan.	



Sr.		THE BENGAL CHAME				
	laaa	Suggestion / Recommendation				
No	Issue					
25	Export : details of multiple invoices against one shipping bill					
	Under GST law supply for export is zero rated provided certain conditions are fulfilled, like furnishing information such as name and address along with country of the recipient on the invoices. In the case of large manufacturer exporter, a	A clarification may please be issued or format of shipping bill may please be revised to take care of such mismatches.				
	number of GST invoices are raised from the factory/mines based on which goods are first moved to the port which may be situated within the State or outside the State thereafter after custom compliances including filing goods are loaded in to the vessels for dispatch to other country.					
	As per the new format of Shipping Bill (copy enclosed) released in GST regime, details of all GST invoices are required to be mentioned in the shipping bill. Further, while filing the GSTR-1, details of all GST invoices including the respective Shipping Bill no. is also required to be uploaded in to GSTN (Goods and Service Tax Network). However, at the time of filing Shipping Bill in the Customs EDI website, the option of mentioning multiple GST invoice details is not being provided in the case of Export under Bond or LUT.					
	Issues/Concerns: The manufacturer exporters raising multiple GST invoices as explained above are facing difficulties and it is being felt by them, that since all the GST invoices in not being mentioned in shipping bill, a mismatch may happen between the GST invoices uploaded in to GSTN and GST invoices uploaded in EDI website. As a result of such mismatch, there can be an issue in claiming export benefit.					
26	Sale of old cars to employee					
	Section 7(1) of the CGST Act defines the term	It is suggested that necessary amendment				
L	Section /(1) or the COST ACT Delines the felli	It is suggested that necessary amendment				



Sr.		THE BENGAL CHAME
No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation
	"Supply" which includes:	should be made in the valuation rule so that sale of used car to employee can be made on
	 a) all forms of supply of goods or services or both such as sale, transfer, barter, exchange, licence, rental, lease or disposal made or agreed to be made for a consideration by a person in the course or furtherance of business; 	written down value.
	 b) import of services for a consideration whether or not in the course or furtherance of business; 	
	 the activities specified in Schedule I, made or agreed to be made without a consideration; and 	
	 d) the activities to be treated as supply of goods or supply of services as referred to in Schedule II. 	
	Supply also include supply of goods or services or both in all the forms, made by a person in course and furtherance of business for consideration; activities mentioned under Schedule - I without consideration; and activities mentioned under Schedule - II.	
	Further, as per section 7(2) of the CGST Act, activities and transaction specified in Schedule III shall be treated as neither as a supply of goods nor a supply of service.	
	In terms of Entry 1 of Schedule III, "Services by an employee to the employer in the course of or in relation to his employment" shall be treated neither as a supply of goods nor a supply of service.	
	From the above it is clear that GST will not be leviable on supply of services by an employee to the employer in the course of or in relation to his employment. But, it does not cover within its ambit the supply of goods or services by an employer to the employee.	



Sr.		THE BENGAL CHAMB
No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation
	As per explanation to section 15 of the CGST	
	Act, employer and employee are considered as	
	related person.	
	Entry 2 of Cohodula I provides that supply will	
	Entry 2 of Schedule I provides that supply will include "Supply of goods or services or both	
	between related persons or distinct persons as	
	specified in section 25, when made in the	
	course or furtherance of business" even if made	
	without consideration.	
	As per the above provisions, even if a supply is	
	made without consideration by an employer to	
	the employee, such transaction will be covered	
	within the ambit of section 7(1) of the CGST Act	
	and will be leviable to GST.	
	As per section 15(1) of the CGST Act, the value	
	of supply shall be the <u>transaction value</u> (price	
	actually paid or payable) where the supplier and	
	recipient are not related and the price is the	
	sole consideration for the supply.	
	Rule 28 of CGST Rules provides for	
	determination of 'Value of supply of goods or	
	services or both between distinct or related	
	persons, other than through an agent which is	
	as under:	
	a) be the open market value of such	
	supply; b) if open market value is not available, be	
	the value of supply of goods or services	
	of like kind and quality;	
	c) if value is not determinable under clause	
	(a) or (b), be the value as determined by	
	application of rule 30 or rule 31, in that	
	order.	
	So from the above it is clear that in case of	
	related parties, GST is payable on open market	
	value of the goods and services.	
	In a large manufacturing organisation, company	
	in a large manufacturing organisation, company	



Sr.		THE BENGAL CHAME
No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation
	owned used car is provided to the employee	
	after certain specified period (say 5 years). Car	
	is sold at written down value (WDV).	
	As per above provision, employer and employee	
	are related party and accordingly as per Rule 28	
	of the valuation rule, GST will be applicable on open market value. Open market value of the	
	used cars is much more than the WDV.	
	Although, in case of sales of such goods to	
	unrelated parties, GST is applicable on the sales	
	price, if no input tax credit has been availed.	
	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	
	In case of sale of second hand goods by an	
	individual, CBEC has already notified that	
	transaction will be exempted from payment of	
	GST.	
	Payment of GST at "open market value" will be	
	difficult to determine and will also result in huge	
	increase in the cost in the hands of the	
	employee.	
27	Reverse charge on Goods and Services	
	Section 12 (3) of the CGST Act provides the in	It is suggested that liability under RCM for
	case of supplies of Goods in respect of which	goods and services both should arise at the
	tax is paid or liable to be paid on reverse charge	time of payment only.
	basis, the time of supply shall be the earliest of	
	the following dates, namely:—	
	a) the date of the receipt of goods; or	
	b) the date of payment as entered in the books	
	of account of the recipient or the date on	
	which the payment is debited in his bank account, whichever is earlier; or	
	c) the date immediately following thirty days	
	from the date of issue of invoice or any	
	other document, by whatever name called,	
	in lieu thereof by the supplier:	
	Provided that where it is not possible to	
	determine the time of supply under clause (a)	
	or clause (b) or clause (c), the time of supply	
	shall be the date of entry in the books of	
	account of the recipient of supply.	



Sr.	THE BENGAL CHA		
No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation	
	Further 13(3) of the CGST Act provides that in		
	case of supplies of services in respect of which		
	tax is paid or liable to be paid on reverse charge		
	basis, the time of supply shall be the earlier of		
	the following dates, namely:—		
	a) the date of payment as entered in the		
	books of account of the recipient or the date		
	on which the payment is debited in his bank		
	account, whichever is earlier; or		
	b) the date immediately following sixty days		
	from the date of issue of invoice or any		
	other document, by whatever name called,		
	in lieu thereof by the supplier:		
	Provided that where it is not possible to		
	determine the time of supply under clause (α)		
	or clause (b), the time of supply shall be the		
	date of entry in the books of account of the		
	recipient of supply:		
	Provided further that in case of supply by		
	associated enterprises, where the supplier of		
	service is located outside India, the time of		
	supply shall be the date of entry in the books of		
	account of the recipient of supply or the date of		
	payment, whichever is earlier.		
	In a large manufacturing company, following		
	different process for RCM for Goods and		
	services will create difficulty in implementing		
	the process. In case of Goods, RCM arises at the		
	time of receipt of goods whereas in case of		
	services it is at the time of payment. Liability of		
	Tax should arise in both case at the time of		
	payment only which is currently mentioned in		
	the existing law.		
28	Tax Credit under GST		
	Clause 17(5) of the CGST Act provides that input	It is suggested that there should not be any	
	tax credit shall not be available in respect of the	restriction in the admissibility of tax credit on	
	following, namely:—	any goods and services and further	
	a) motor vehicles and other conveyances	clarification should be provided on the	
	except when they are used—	meaning of "furtherance of business" to	
	(i) for making the following taxable	avoid any dispute in future. Further there	
	supplies, namely:—	should not be any restriction that the goods	



Sr.				Suggestion / Recommendation
No	Issue			Suggestion / Recommendation
			A. further supply of such	should be used in factory.
			vehicles or conveyances; or	
			B. transportation of	
			passengers; or	
			C. imparting training on driving,	
			flying, navigating such vehicles or conveyances;	
		(ii)	for transportation of goods;	
	h)	` '	following supply of goods or services	
			oth:—	
		(i)	food and beverages, outdoor	
		• /	catering, beauty treatment, health	
			services, cosmetic and plastic	
			surgery except where an inward	
			supply of goods or services or both	
			of a particular category is used by	
			a registered person for making an	
			outward taxable supply of the	
			same category of goods or services	
			or both or as an element of a	
			taxable composite or mixed supply;	
		(ii)	membership of a club, health and	
		(11)	fitness centre;	
		(iii)	rent-a-cab, life insurance and	
		,	health insurance except where	
			A. the Government notifies the	
			services which are obligatory	
			for an employer to provide to	
			its employees under any law	
			for the time being in force; or	
			B. such inward supply of goods	
			or services or both of a particular category is used by	
			a registered person for making	
			an outward taxable supply of	
			the same category of goods or	
			services or both or as part of a	
			taxable composite or mixed	
			supply; and	
		(iv)	travel benefits extended to	
			employees on vacation such as	



Sr.	THE BENGAL CHAM			
No	Issue		Suggestion / Recommendation	
		leave or home travel concession;		
	c)	works contract services when supplied		
		for construction of an immovable		
		property (other than plant and		
		machinery) except where it is an input		
		service for further supply of works		
		contract service;		
	d)	goods or services or both received by a		
		taxable person for construction of an		
		immovable property (other than plant or		
		machinery) on his own account including		
		when such goods or services or both are		
		used in the course or furtherance of		
		business.		
	e)	goods or services or both on which tax		
	٤/	has been paid under section 10;		
	f)	goods or services or both received by a		
		non-resident taxable person except on goods imported by him;		
	g)	goods imported by fiffi, goods or services or both used for		
	81	personal consumption;		
	h)	goods lost, stolen, destroyed, written off		
	,	or disposed of by way of gift or free		
	i)	samples; and		
	j)	any tax paid in accordance with the		
	, ,,	provisions of sections 74, 129 and 130.		
	Furthe	r Section 17(6) provides that the		
		nment may prescribe the manner in which		
	the cre	edit referred to in subsections (1) and (2)		
	may b	e attributed.		
	Explan	ation.— For the purposes of this Chapter		
	and Ch	napter VI, the expression "plant and		
		nery" means apparatus, equipment, and		
		nery fixed to earth by foundation or		
		ural support that are used for making		
		rd supply of goods or services or both and		
		es such foundation and structural		
		rts but excludes—		
		d, building or any other civil structures;		
		ecommunication towers; and		
		pelines laid outside the factory premises.		
		te of the GST is to allow full tax credit and		
	nence	there should not be any restrictions as		



Sr.	THE BENGAL CHAM		
Sr. No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation	
No	exist in the present system of indirect tax in India. Any restriction in input tax credit will result into cascading effect of taxes and increased cost of goods and services. As per definition of "input tax" any assesse who is in the business of supply of goods/services will incur expenditure only in "furtherance of business or commerce". For example a manufacturer is required to have a canteen in its factory for its employees and he engages an outdoor caterer for supplying foods who charges him GST. Such expenditures are also incurred in furtherance of business or commerce only. Further In the CGST Bill Government has also disallowed the Tax credit for pipeline laid outside the factory premises. In a large manufacturing company huge pipeline are commissioned for various purposes i.e. for taking water from river for directly used in the manufacturing purpose etc. In Such cases part of the entire pipeline system is inside factory and part remain outside factory. However it is a part of entire pipeline system which is used for furtherance of business only. Further In GST regime State wise Registration is allowed. So for the purpose of availing tax credit there should not be any restriction of any factory. It will increase the cost of product which is against the basic purpose of GST.		
30	Reversal of Input tax credit		
30	Clause 16(2) of the CGST Act provides that	It is suggested that the condition of payment	
	No registered person shall be entitled to the credit of any input tax in respect of any supply	to vendor within 180 days on goods should be removed.	
	of goods or services or both to him unless,—	removed.	
	(a) he is in possession of a tax invoice or debit		
	note issued by a supplier registered under this		
	Act, or such other tax paying documents as may		
	be prescribed; (b) he has received the goods or services or		
	(n) the tras received the Books of services of		



Sr.		THE BENGAL CHAMB
No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation
	both.	
	(c) subject to the provisions of section 41,the	
	tax charged in respect of such supply has been	
	actually paid to the Government, either in cash	
	or through utilisation of input tax credit	
	admissible in respect of the said supply; and	
	(d) he has furnished the return under section	
	39:	
	Provided that where the goods against an	
	invoice are received in lots or instalments, the	
	registered person shall be entitled to take credit	
	upon receipt of the last lot or instalment:	
	Provided further that where a recipient fails to	
	pay to the supplier of goods or services or	
	both , other than the supplies on which tax is	
	payable on reverse charge basis, the amount	
	towards the value of supply along with tax	
	payable thereon within a period of one	
	hundred and eighty days from the date of issue	
	of invoice by the supplier, an amount equal to	
	the input tax credit availed by the recipient shall	
	be added to his output tax liability, along with	
	interest thereon, in such manner as may be	
	prescribed:	
	Provided also that the recipient shall be entitled	
	to avail of the credit of input tax on payment made by him of the amount towards the value	
	of supply of goods or services or both along with	
	tax payable thereon.	
	tax payable thereon.	
	Further, Rule 37 of the CGST Rule provides that	
	1) A registered person, who has availed of	
	input tax credit on any inward supply of	
	goods services or both, but fails to pay to	
	the supplier thereof the value of such supply	
	along with the tax payable thereon within	
	the time limit specified in the second	
	proviso to sub-section (2) of section 16, shall	
	furnish the details of such supply and the	
	amount of input tax credit availed of in	
	FORM GSTR-2 for the month immediately	
	following the period of one hundred and	
	eighty days from the date of issue of invoice.	



Sr.		THE BENGAL CHAMB
No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation
	 The amount of input tax credit referred to in sub-rule (1) shall be added to the output tax liability of the registered person for the month in which the details are furnished. The registered person shall be liable to pay interest at the rate notified under subsection (1) of section 50 for the period starting from the date of availing credit on such supplies till the date when the amount added to the output tax liability, as mentioned in sub-rule (2), is paid. It will have significant impact on the large industries. In case of execution of the major engineering, procurement and construction (EPC) type of the contract certain portion of the payment is made to the vendor only after satisfactory completion of the project which may take even more than two years. In the existing tax regime, there is no condition of payment to supplier for availment of cenvat credit in case of goods. Further, in GST regime tax credit will be allowe3d to the recipient when the supplier will paid the tax to the Government. So when credit is being allowed on the basis of matching concept then reversal on the basis of payment to vendor should not be a condition. It will create difficulty for the assesse. 	
31	Maintenance of Accounts and Records	
	Section 35(1) of CGST Act, 2017 prescribes that every registered person shall keep and maintain, at his principal place of business, as mentioned in the certificate of registration, a true and correct account of— (a) production or manufacture of goods; (b) inward and outward supply of goods or services or both; (c) stock of goods; (d) input tax credit availed; (e) output tax payable and paid; and (f) such other particulars as may be prescribed: Provided that where more than one place of	It is suggested that the provision should be amended so as to maintain accounts with respect to 5 items mentioned in section 35(1) of CGST Act 2017, at principal place of business only and not at all the place of business. This will promote ease of operation. Secondly regarding profit and loss accounts, it is suggested that requirement of furnishing state-wise gross and net profits as per profit and loss accounts in annual return GSTR-9 should be removed.





C	THE BENGAL CHAM		
Sr. No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation	
	In a large manufacturing organisation, there are many types of raw materials or services which are used directly or indirectly in the manufacture of a product. Hence keeping accountal of quantitative data of each raw material or service used in the manufacture will be a difficult task for the organisation. Secondly, GST is supposed to bring so much of transparency through upload of inwards, outward details, matching concept etc, then it seems no requirement for maintenance of so much of accounts and records relating to raw material, finished goods, services etc at such detailed level.		
32	Accounts and Records: Digitization of invoices		
	As per Rule 16(2) of the CGST Act, no registered person shall be entitled to the credit of any input tax in respect of any supply of goods or services or both to him unless,— (a) he is in possession of a tax invoice or debit note issued by a supplier registered under this Act, or such other tax paying documents as may be prescribed; It appears from the condition mentioned in the above section that the tax invoices, debit note, credit note should be kept physically for availment of credit.	A clarification may be issued regarding maintenance of records in electronic form and all types of documents should be allowed to be kept in electronic form (may be scan copy of the invoices etc). It will promote digitalisation of the economy of the country.	
	However, Rule 56(15) prescribes that the records under the GST rules may be maintained in electronic form and the record so maintained shall be authenticated by means of a digital signature. But the rules does not clarify whether the invoices, debit notes, credit notes, vouchers etc can be kept in electronic form or not. Large business organisation with presence in multiple locations is rapidly adopting the concept of "shared service". A shared service centre works as a central office engaged in performing the activities related to payments to		



Sr.		THE BENGAL CHAMB
No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation
	vendors, sales invoicing, tax payments, salary processing etc with an objective of standardizing the processes, improving efficiency and quality of services. In this model, transactions are processed on the basis of the scanned copies of the invoices and hard copy is stored in one place which can be different from the registered premises. Therefore, it is important the "input tax credit "of GST should be allowed on the basis of the scanned copies of the invoices. Further, CBEC has already introduced the concept of matching of the invoices which will ensure the genuiness of the tax credit availed by the purchaser and in case hard copies of the invoices are required to be checked on sample basis the tax payer should be allowed to produce the same within a reasonable period of time say 15 days.	
33	Interstate supplies to Job Work:	
	Section 143 of the GST Act provides for special procedure for removal of goods. As per the Act, the principal may under intimation and subject to conditions as may be prescribed, send any inputs and / or capital goods, without payment of tax, to a job worker for job-work and from there subsequently send to another job worker and likewise.	It is suggested that the provision should clearly define the supplies to the job worker situated outside the State without payment of tax.
	Provided that the "principal" shall not supply the goods from the place of business of a job worker in terms of clause (b) unless the said "principal" declares the place of business of the job-worker as his additional place of business except in a case- (i) where the job worker is registered under section 23; or (ii) Where the "principal" is engaged in the supply of such goods as may be notified by the Commissioner in this behalf.	
	Due to complex business scenario and other	



Sr.		THE BENGAL CHAMB
Sr. No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation
	financial constraints job work has become one of the major activity for any big manufacturing Company. The job workers are situated within the State as well as outside the State, due to the different business requirements. As per the provision, it is very clear that the supply of goods from the place of principal to the job workers can be done without payment of GST .However, it is not clear from the law whether supplies to the jobworker situated outside the State can also be done without payment of GST.	
34	Reverse Charge on CIF contract	
	Section 5(3) of the IGST ACT provides that The Government may, on the recommendations of the Council, by notification, specify categories of supply of goods or services or both, the tax on which shall be paid on reverse charge basis by the recipient of such goods or services or both and all the provisions of this Act shall apply to such recipient as if he is the person liable for paying the tax in relation to the supply of such goods or services or both. Section 2(93) of the CGST Act defines "recipient" of supply of goods or services or both, means—	It is suggested that the necessary amendment in the ACT should be made so that Government through notification can define recipient of service through notification.
	 a) where a consideration is payable for the supply of goods or services or both, the person who is liable to pay that consideration; b) where no consideration is payable for the supply of goods, the person to whom the goods are delivered or made available, or to whom possession or use of the goods is given or made available; and c) where no consideration is payable for 	
	the supply of a service, the person to whom the service is rendered,	



Sr.			THE BENGAL CHAME
No	Issue		Suggestion / Recommendation
INU	and any reference to a prismade shall be constructed from the recipier shall include an agent according to the recipient in relationservices or both supplied Section 2(98) of the CGS charge" as the liability to recipient of supply of go	nt of the supply and cting as such on behalf on to the goods or d; IT Act defines "reverse o pay tax by the cods or services or both of such goods or services on (3) or sub-section (4) ab-section (3) or the Integrated	
	From the above it is clear Reverse charge liability is only by the recipient. Further been defined under sect Act as a person who pay supplier of goods or serve CBEC has specified the confalling under reverse charges. No. 10/2017- Integrated 28.06.2017. In the notified of the confidence of the confi	is required to be paid orther, recipient has tion 2(93) of the CGST is the consideration to vice. Tategory of services arge vide Notification ITax (Rate) dated	
	10/2017- Integrated Tax 28.06.2017 provides tha Importer will be conside service.	Io 10 of Notification No. (Rate) dated It Pred as recipient of	
	Category of Supply of Services Services supplied by a person located in non- taxable territory by way of transportation of	Supplier of service A person located in non-taxable territory	



Sr.	THE BENGAL CHAM				
No	Issue		Sug	gestion / Recommendation	
NO	goods by a vessel from a place outside India up to the customs station of clearance in India. In case of CIF contract, to	here are three parties			
	to Indian Port to Sel b) Seller of Goods who an importer in India	loods from outside India ler of Goods. It is selling the goods to			
	Vessel Owner (service poservice of transportation the Seller of Goods (service provider and the located outside India. As CGST ACT, recipient i.e. payment to the service poods but as per Sl. No 210/2017, importer is the	n of goods in a vessel to vice recipient). Both the service recipient are sper section 2(93) of the person who makes provider is the seller of 10 of the notification no			
	Section 5(3) of IGST act Government can <u>only</u> no categories of supply of g which will fall under rev cannot be notified throu has already defined und CGST ACT.	otify the specify goods or services or both erse charge. Recipient igh as notification as it			
	So as per section 2(93) of the seller of goods who Accordingly no GST show reverse charge in case of	is located outside India. Ild be payable under			
35	Goods and Service Tax	on PDA Charges			
	CIF contract comprises of material, insurance and	of cost of the imported	We	suggest the following mechan	ism:
	case of CIF import, the c	bligation to arrange for	It is	suggested that GST should no	t be levied



Sr.		THE BENGAL CHAME
No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation
	transportation rests with the Exporter who	on the PDA charges as it results into double
	enters into a chartered party agreement with	payment of tax which result in escalating the
	the shipping line for agreed amount of ocean	cost of CIF import into India.
	freight. The service provider (the shipping line)	
	and the service recipient (exporter) both are	OR,
	located in non-taxable territory.	
		An appropriate mechanism should be devised
	Further, Ocean freight interalia includes the	to enable the importer to avail the Tax Credit
	following charges called PDA Charges:	of GST on PDA charges in the case of CIF
	Pilotage & Towage	import into India. Deeming fiction may be
	Berth Hire	created with respect to Port services
	Shifting & Anchorage fees	(particularly those services against which PDA
	Port Dues	charges are paid by steamer agent to Port)
	Cold Movement	rendered by Port to foreign shipping line
	Fresh Water Supply	through the agency of steamer agent in order
		to enable the importer to avail credit of GST
	Out of the aforesaid, charges for pilotage &	paid by Steamer agent on PDA charges.
	towage, berth hire, shifting and anchorage	
	constitutes "Port Disbursement A/c Charges	
	('PDA')" and forms major component of ocean	
	freight. Port issues a tax invoice for PDA charges	
	in the form of "Marine Dues Bill" along with	
	Goods & service tax @ 18%. The Goods &	
	service tax is charged by Ports for rendering	
	"Port Services". The invoice issued by the Port	
	for Port DA charges reflects the name of the	
	Vessel carrying the cargo and the name of the	
	steamer agent. Suppose ocean freight amount is	
	Rs. 100 including PDA charges of Rs 20. Port Authorities charges GST on Rs. 20 as the service	
	is provided in Indian Territory by the Port. GST	
	on PDA charges is noncreditable as the vessel	
	owner is a foreign party and does not have an	
	output GST liability and hence is not in a	
	position to claim input tax credit.	
	Section 5(3) of the IGST Act provides that	
	"The Government may, on the	
	recommendations of the Council, by	
	notification, specify categories of supply of	
	goods or services or both, the tax on which shall	
	be paid on reverse charge basis by the recipient	



		THE BENGAL CHAMB
Sr. No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation
	of such goods or services or both and all the provisions of this Act shall apply to such recipient as if he is the person liable for paying the tax in relation to the supply of such goods or services or both." SI. No 10 of the Notification No.10/2017 integrated tax (rate) dated 28.6.2017 provides that importer will pay Goods and Service Tax (GST) under reverse charge in case of CIF contract.	
	Category of Supply of Services	
	Services supplied by a person located in non- taxable territory by way of transportation of goods by a vessel from a place outside India up to the customs station of clearance in India	
	Further, corrigendum to Notification no 8/2017-Integrated Tax (Rate), dated the 28th June, 2017 provides that GST will be payable @ 10% of the CIF value of imported goods.	
	From the above it is clear that in case of import of goods, GST is payable under reverse charge by the recipient for transportation of goods by a vessel from a place outside India up to the customs station of clearance in India and tax credit of GST paid under reverse charge is available to importer.	
	As mentioned above, in case of ocean freight the "Importer" has a liability to pay IGST under reverse charge. Ocean freight charges which is ultimately borne by the importer also includes the element of IGST paid by vessel owner on PDA charges and to this extent there is a double taxation of GST on PDA charges.	
	We would like to bring to the attention of your	



Sr.		THE BENGAL CHAME
No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation
	goodself the definition of "input service "as defined in section 2(60) of the CGST Act which is	
	as under:	
	"input service" means any service used or intended to be used by a supplier in the course	
	or furtherance of business;	
	In the instant case, there is no doubt that the	
	expenditure of IGST on PDA charges is an	
	expenditure in furtherance of business but	
	importer is but importer is unable to get input tax credit of the same only due to the reason	
	that direct payment has not been made by	
	<u>importer.</u> .	
	In view of the above, the IGST paid on the PDA	
	charges is becoming a cost in the system which	
	is unfair and against the basic spirit of Goods and Service Tax to provide seamless flow of	
	input tax credit.	
36	Matching of Tax credit	
	42(1) The details of every inward supply	It is suggested that the matching concept
	furnished by a registered person (hereafter in this section referred to as the "recipient") for a	should be removed and full tax credit should be allowed to the purchaser if he has
	tax period shall, in such manner and within such	received the goods/service and is having a
	time as may be prescribed, be matched—	valid tax invoice.
	 a) with the corresponding details of outward supply furnished by the 	
	corresponding registered person	
	(hereafter in this section referred to as	
	the "supplier") in his valid return for the	
	same tax period or any preceding tax period;	
	b) with the integrated goods and services	
	tax paid under section 3 of the Customs	
	Tariff Act, 1975 in respect of goods imported by him; and	
	c) for duplication of claims of input tax	
	credit.	



Sr.		THE BENGAL CHAMB
No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation
	(2) The claim of input tax credit in respect of	
	invoices or debit notes relating to inward supply	
	that match with the details of corresponding	
	outward supply or with the integrated goods	
	and services tax paid under section 3 of the	
	Customs Tariff Act, 1975 in respect of goods	
	imported by him shall be finally accepted and	
	such acceptance shall be communicated, in such	
	manner as may be prescribed, to the recipient.	
	(3) Where the input tax credit claimed by a	
	recipient in respect of an inward supply is in	
	excess of the tax declared by the supplier for	
	the same supply or the outward supply is not	
	declared by the supplier in his valid returns, the	
	discrepancy shall be communicated to both	
	such persons in such manner as may be	
	prescribed.	
	(4) The duplication of claims of input tax credit	
	shall be communicated to the recipient in such	
	manner as may be prescribed.	
	(5) the amount in respect of which any	
	discrepancy is communicated under sub-section	
	(3) and which is not rectified by the supplier in	
	his valid return for the month in which	
	discrepancy is communicated shall be added to	
	the output tax liability of the recipient, in such	
	manner as may be prescribed, in his return for	
	the month succeeding the month in which the	
	discrepancy is communicated.	
	From the above it is clear that in case of any	
	mismatch, output liability of the recipient will	
	be increased and tax along with interest will be	
	payable.	
	CBEC vide notification no 18/2017 dated 8 th Aug	
	has extended the date of filling of GSTR-1 for	
	the month of July 17 to 5 th Sept 17 which was	
	further extended to 10 th Sept. GSTN site was	
	crashed during details of invoice wise upload by	



Sr.		THE BENGAL CHAME
No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation
	the tax payers due to which it was decided in the GST council meeting that a major change in the GSTN is required and date of GSTR-1 was extended by almost 1 month i.e. 10 th Oct, 2017.	
	Further, on 12 th Sept, 2017, Union Finance Minister constituted a Group of Ministers (GoM) under the convenorship of the Deputy Chief Minister of Bihar, Shri Sushil Kumar Modi,in order to monitor and resolve the IT challenges faced in the implementation of GST.	
	Due to issue in GSTN server tax payers are unable to upload the details. Further, if the details will not be uploaded correctly then the recipient will not be able to avail tax credit.	
	Tax credit to the purchaser should not be denied, as in such a situations the purchaser has no fault. Further, in the erstwhile Cenvat Credit Rules, 2004 or in the State VAT Rules also there is no provision which debars the tax credit to the purchaser on account of error at the end of the supplier/vendor.	
37	Export promotion capital goods scheme and its i	mplication in GST regime.
	There are various exemption/benefit schemes available under foreign trade policy which are provided to industries with the objective to strengthen India's presence in the global business scenario and to promote export led growth of the Country. One of such scheme is Export promotion capital goods (EPCG) scheme under which capital goods are allowed to be imported in India at concessional customs duty (presently 0%) subject to fulfilment of export obligations. The provisions governing the EPCG scheme are contained in Foreign Trade Policy (FTP).	It is suggested that suitable provision should be made in the GST Act/Rules to deal with such situations. The provision should also allow input tax credit of the taxes/ duties (CVD, Cess on CVD and SAD) or IGST paid on such cases. There is an immediate need for this clarification as it has created a state of confusion in the minds of the tax payers .Provision should allow the input tax credit of taxes/duties paid otherwise it will result in huge increase in the cost in the hands of importer which is unfair.
	Currently, Export obligation equivalent to 6 times of duty saved on capital goods imported under EPCG scheme needs to be fulfilled in 6	



Sr.		THE BENGAL CHAME
No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation
No	years. There may be a situation where the manufacturer who has imported the capital goods but may not be able to fulfil the export obligation. In such a situation, he has to pay the amount of "duty saved". The "duty saved" normally includes Basic customs duty(BCD), Cess on Customs duty, Countervailing duty(CVD), Cess on countervailing duty, Special Additional duty(SAD) out of which CVD, Cess on CVD and SAD is cenvatable and the same can be utilised against payment of excise duty. There can be a scenario in which a manufacturer decides to pay the "duty saved" in GST regime due to non-fulfilment of export obligation. There is no specific provision in the GST Act/Rules to deal with this situation . It is not clear whether the same duty (CVD, Cess on CVD and SAD) as mentioned above will be payable or IGST will be payable. Secondly, Act/Rules is also salient as to whether the input tax credit of such tax/ duties paid in GST regime in case of non-fulfilment of export obligations will be available or not.	
38	Export Obligation under EPCG Benefits	
	As per the Annual supplement to Foreign Trade policy dated 18 th April 2013, Export obligation discharge by the export of alternate products as well as export of group companies has been withdrawn under EPCG Scheme.	It is suggested to restore the old provision to facilitate the exports.
39	Reduction of Multiple GST Rates:	
	When the GST was conceived it was supposed to be a single uniform rate across all product categories, but the shape that the GST has taken is far removed from the actual concept of ONE COUNTRY-ONE TAX. What instead we have got is a Multi-Ties Tax Structure with 8 different tax rates - i.e. @0%, @1%, @2%, @3%, @5%, @12%, @18% and @28%	which should be eliminated/clubbed into maximum Two Types like the GST Rate prevails in most of the developed foreign countries
40	Anti-profiteering measures/Lack of Clarity:	



Sr.		THE BENGAL CHAMB
No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation
	The government has set up an authority to see if any reduction in tax rates after the introduction of GST is passed on to the consumer by companies or not. The industry and businesses are not taking this idea kindly and they see it as a backdoor entry of inspector raj. Prices should be market determined and no government authority has the business of deciding prices for goods and services. GST's anti-profiteering clause requires companies to pass on the benefit of lower taxes to consumers but little clarity over anti-profiteering clause has led to confusion over setting of selling prices for goods. The law doesn't clarify how the costs incurred on account of transition from GST to non-GST era are to be factored in. It also doesn't specify how loss-making units pass on the benefits. Many feel the possible savings in one category will offset increases elsewhere and there is no mechanism yet to compute that. Many companies are producing two sets of price tags for the same product to avoid confusion. But comparison of profit or loss for pre- and post-GST period would be difficult for companies. More clarity will emerge only when the National Anti-Profiteering Authority determines the methodology and procedure for taking up cases. Under this law, businesses can be closed down by government if it finds that companies are not passing on the benefits of lower tax slabs to the consumers. Industry and traders are concerned about tax terrorism and arbitrary reasoning of profit and loss in a preand post-GST era. Such anti-profiteering laws were introduced in Malaysia and proved to be a disaster.	A clarification is needed in this regard
41	Taxation of free supplies between related parties	S:
	The GST law proposes to tax any free supplies between two related parties. The problem arises especially in case of related parties located in different states. Such transactions between related parties in different states mean	There is no centralized registration system under GST and therefore, this would create compliance issue for companies.



C.,	THE BENGAL CHAM		
Sr. No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation	
	each party would have to generate invoice, maintain documents, etc.		
42	Anti-competition and Protectionism by State governments:		
	Section 22(1) of the CGST Act allows a registration waiver for small traders having a turnover of less than 20 lacs per year. So, small traders who earn below this threshold don't need to register for GST. However, two sections later, 24(1) immediately denies this 20 lacs threshold exemption for those small traders who perform inter-state trade. Now, this clause creates some undesirable effects on our economy.	where each state indirectly subsidizes small traders in its own state for a GST waiver up to this threshold, but traders from other states are denied this benefit.	
43	Quarterly Returns:		
	Return filling be made quarterly, (for traders having turn-over up to 10 crores a year).	GST payment monthly, There is no loss or delay of revenue receipt to the Government but to ease the statutory compliance.	
44	Provision for Revised Return:		
	Rectification of Return is needed for earlier periods	There should be a provision for rectification of return by way of filing Revised Return	
45	Penalties & Prosecution		
	All provisions of penalty/prosecution must be set aside for at least one year.	As the tax payers are not familiar with the Provisions of GST act so it is recomanded that set aside all the penal provision of this act.	
46	HSN Code Confusions:	1	
<u> </u>	Though HSN codes are meant to be harmonized, we find that they have many anomalies. Similar items are having different codes and rate of taxes. At times, with just change of description or measurement. It makes it very difficult for traders to understand or follow.	Usage of HSN Code for the traders may create confusion. So clarity is needed on this Matter.	
47	Clubbing of CGST & SGST in GST Invoice:		
	Since the equal bifurcation of GST (between SGST & CGST) is prerecorded	we believe GSTN is capable to auto bifurcate and allot the amount separately, in totality, without needing traders to do so, invoice	



Sr.	THE BENGAL CHAM	
No	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation
		wise.
48	ITC in Relation to Evacues	
48	ITC in Relation to Expenses	Francisco in accuracy disc moletic as to proceed
	Sec 17(5) of the CGST Act, 2017 ('Act') restricts	Expenses incurred in relation to motor
	credit in respect of Motor Vehicles except in few	vehicle, eg repair & maintenance, insurance etc. should be allowed as credit
	cases.	etc. Siloulu de alloweu as credit
49	GTA SERVICE	
	Security agency carrying currency for RBI should	Goods u/s 2(52) of the Act "goods" as every
	be regarded as a GTA?	kind of movable property other than money
		and securities but includes actionable claim,
		growing crops, grass and things attached to
		or forming part of the land which are agreed to be severed before supply or under a
		contract of supply.
		contract or supply.
50	Bad Debt	
	In case of Bad debt the amount of GST shall be	Indirect tax is a tax which charge from the
	borne by the assessee from his own pocket.	customer, in case if assessee has to pay it
		from his own pocket then Relief from
		payment of GST should be allowed in cases of
		Bad Debt.
51	Pure Agent	
	a) Can a travel agent booking only a hotel for a	Clarity is required on the matters
	client, act in capacity of a pure agent while	
	booking the hotel. In other words, is it	
	important for the supplier of service to provide	
	a service other than that for which it acts as a	
	pure agent?	
	b) Is it mandatory for the bill to be in the name	
	of the service recipient and not in name of	
	supplier acting as a pure agent?	
	c) A travel agent (Mr. B) is booking a hotel for a	
	client through a supplier of hotels (say Mr. A).	
	Mr. B fulfills all the conditions of being a pure	
	agent to its client. Mr. A in turn books the hotel	
	directly through the hotel (say Taj Hotel). Can in	
	such a case, Mr. B be called a pure agent of its	
	customer considering the fact that the hotel	
	service it procures is not directly through the	
	hotel but through a vendor?	



	THE BENGAL CHAM	
Sr.	Issue	Suggestion / Recommendation
No	Issue	
F 2	Traval Acout	
52	Travel Agent	Clarification is assumed on the most of
	a) Can a air travel agent change the valuation	Clarification is required on the matter.
	method in the middle of the year?	
	b) Does the valuation prescribed under Rule	
	32(3) of the CGST Rules, 2017 ('Rules') cover	
	both the commission earned by an air travel	
	agent from the airlines and also the service	
	charge it charges it customers?	
	A travel agent in India getting a booking done by	
	another travel agent abroad in respect of a	
	hotel located abroad. Will reverse charge apply	
	on the travel agent of India u/s 13(4) of the IGST	
	Act?	
53	FINANCIAL INSTITUTION	
	In case of banks and NBFCs, it is impractical to	The term "inputs and capital goods" should
	do a one-to-one correlation between the	be excluded from Section 17(4) of the CGST
	supplies used for earning the exempt income	Act, 2017
	(interest income) and taxable income (service	OR
	fee, operating lease rental, etc.). Thus, NBFCs	A specific proviso should be added under
	would be obligated to pay an amount equal to	Section 17(4) as under:
	50% of the credit availed. Hence, the taxes paid	
	on procurement (CGST+SGST or IGST) will be	"Provided further that the restriction of fifty
	available for setoff only to the extent of 50%. As	per cent shall not apply to the tax paid on
	a result, GST credit attributable to goods	goods and services procured for leasing"
	procured for leasing business would be reduced	50% credit reversal should be restricted only
	to an extent of 50% instead of 100% as available	on input services to keep the provisions at
	presently under the State VAT laws. This will	par with the current regime.
	push up the cost of procurement of assets for	OR
	leasing significantly. It will have an adverse	100% credit should be granted on goods and
	impact on the leasing business and especially	services purchased for leasing
	affect the MSME and agriculture sectors which	
	heavily depend on procurement of equipment	
	through lease. Further, since leasing of assets to	
	infrastructure players happens to be the core	
	business of NBFCs, if the credits on	
	procurement of infrastructure assets are	
	restricted only to the extent of 50%, the same	
	will push up the cost of supplies for NBFCs too.	

